

The Organic Content of the Tagish Lake Meteorite

Sandra Pizzarello,¹ Yongsong Hang,² Luann Becker,³ Robert J. Poreda,⁴ Ronald A. Nieman,¹ George Cooper,⁵ Michael Williams¹

¹Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ 85287, USA. ²Department of Geological Sciences, Brown University, Providence, RI 02912, USA. ³School of Oceanography, University of Washington, Seattle, WA 98195, USA. ⁴Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Rochester, Rochester, NY 14627, USA. ⁵NASA Ames Research Center, Moffet Field, CA 94035, USA.

The Tagish Lake meteorite fell last year on a frozen lake in Canada and may provide the most pristine material of its kind. Analyses have now shown this carbonaceous chondrite to contain a suite of soluble organic compounds (~ 100 ppm) that includes: mono- and dicarboxylic acids, dicarboximides, pyridine carboxylic acids, a sulfonic acid, and both aliphatic and aromatic hydrocarbons. The insoluble carbon exhibits exclusive aromatic character, deuterium enrichment, and fullerenes containing “planetary” helium and argon. The findings provide insight to an outcome of early solar chemical evolution which differs from any seen so far in meteorites.

The biogenic elements have a long cosmic history that spans their stellar nucleosynthesis through complex stages of interstellar, nebular, and planetary processes that preceded life. Some of this prebiotic chemical evolution is recorded in carbonaceous chondrites, a primitive type of meteorite containing organic carbon. While a majority of this carbon is bound in a kerogen-like, insoluble material CM and, to a lesser extent, CI chondrites also contain a large and complex suite of soluble organics (*1*). The presence of amino acids and other compounds having terrestrial counterparts has led to speculation that comets and meteorites could have seeded the early earth with bioprecursor molecules (*2*).

The Tagish Lake meteorite fell January 2000 in Canada and is a carbonaceous chondrite of uncertain classification (*3*). Its fall, brief environmental exposure, and collection at subfreezing conditions were exceptional, raising expectations for a pristine sample. We report here the findings from analyses of the soluble and insoluble organic content of approximately half (4.5 gram) of a pristine (*3*) stone surrounded by fusion crust. We have conducted water and solvent extractions of interior powdered samples and NMR analyses of the insoluble organic material obtained after dissolution of mineral phases. The analytical procedures followed closely those established for the study of similar carbonaceous meteorites (*4-7*).

The Tagish Lake meteorite contains about 100 parts per million (ppm) of soluble organic compounds (Table 1). The most varied between them are the aliphatic dicarboxylic acids of the water extract (*5*), an homologous suite of saturated and unsaturated compounds of up to ten carbon atoms (*8*). Linear, saturated acids predominate, decreasing in amount with increasing chain length (Fig. 1), and occurring also as dicarboximides in the case of the more abundant species. A sample of the Murchison meteorite, a well-characterized CM chondrite (*1*), was analyzed under identical conditions and showed a dicarboxylic acid suite of remarkably similar

abundance and distribution, the only difference being a lower ratio of linear to branched acids. The similarity extends to the isotopic composition, as shown by the gas chromatography-combustion-isotope ratio mass spectrometry (GC-C-IRMS) of individual diacids (*9*) (Table 2). Although the Tagish Lake compounds were consistently lighter, the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values were at least 60% of the Murchison counterparts in each case.

Aromatic dicarboxylic acids were also observed in benzene/methanol extracts as a series of imide derivatives of phthalic acid, homophthalic acid, and some methyl and dimethyl homologues not seen in Murchison. A total of nine were detected based on their mass spectra and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of five of these imides were found greater than terrestrial values (*10*), varying from +1.5‰ for homophthalimide to + 17.1‰ for a dimethyl homologue of phthalimide (*11*).

Carboxylated pyridines were found in the water extract with the amino acids, with which these molecules share amphoteric properties and biochemical relevance. Nicotinic acid, its two isomers, and twelve methyl and dimethyl homologues, with substituents both in the aromatic ring and the carboxylated side chains, were identified by GC-MS of their isopropyl derivatives. These compounds have not been described in Murchison, but were searched for in this study and observed as a similar suite in that CM also.

Most of the other water-soluble compounds found in Tagish Lake are less abundant than in Murchison by one (carboxylic acids) to three orders (amino acids). They are also far less numerous and the amounts of each series are dominated by the lower homologues. This distribution is in stark contrast with the extensive isomerism of CM chondrites and is exemplified by Tagish Lake monocarboxylic acids. These compounds account for a significant fraction of soluble organics but only the linear acids up to C₉ were identified, and then only in trace amounts beyond C₂, i.e. individual formic and acetic acids are only slightly less abundant than in Murchison (*12*). The case of sulfonic acids is extreme as they are represented in Tagish Lake by only methane sulfonic acid (MSA). Interestingly, a larger $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and a ³³S anomaly (opposite sign) for Murchison MSA relative to higher homologues suggested a distinct origin for meteoritic MSA (*13*). Tagish Lake results are consistent with that suggestion.

Tagish Lake aliphatic hydrocarbons include both saturated and cyclic and/or unsaturated species. The normal alkanes predominate with peak abundance at C₂₃. In view of the pristine nature of this meteorite, the finding is interesting in regard to the question whether the Murchison n-alkanes are indigenous (*14*) or terrestrial contaminants (*6, 15*). The $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of several n-alkanes determined by GC-C-IRMS range from - 18.8‰ (C₁₆) to -29.0‰ (C₂₀), while those of branched and

unsaturated and/or cyclo alkanes are similar (-18.4‰ to -27.1‰). These values are in the range of terrestrial organic compounds (10); however, other Tagish Lake materials which are considered indigenous, such as the macromolecular carbon, also have low $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values. The low $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ value (-25‰) obtained for phenanthrene may indicate a general depletion in ^{13}C in this meteorite's hydrocarbons relative to other organics.

HF/HCl digestion of Tagish Lake powders yielded ~2.4% of total weight as a carbonaceous residue with the general formula $\text{C}_{100}\text{H}_{46}\text{N}_{10}\text{O}_{15}$, accounting for over 99% of total organic carbon. This macromolecular material was analyzed by solid state ^{13}C nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR) (16) along with a sample of the Orgueil meteorite, a CI chondrite that compares with Tagish Lake in insoluble carbon content. The spectra (Fig. 2) reveal that the Tagish Lake insoluble carbon is composed of predominantly aromatic material and clearly differs from those of the Orgueil, Murchison, and Allende meteorites where both aromatic and aliphatic features are observed (7, 17-18). A δD of $+930 \pm 6\%$, was obtained for the residue (19), a value consistent with an origin from interstellar aromatic species (20) and corresponding to the upper limits of δD values measured for Murchison ($+483\%$ to $+1066\%$) (21).

The acid digested material also released fullerenes when further extracted (22). Laser desorption mass spectrometry (LDMS) revealed a limited series of higher fullerenes between C_{60}^+ and C_{160}^+ , as compared to the Murchison distribution (23) that displays a broader range of molecules (C_{60}^+ to C_{250}^+) dominated by the higher fullerenes (Fig. 3). This may be attributed to different compositions of the original nebular condensates and/or to different aqueous and thermal processing. The isotopic composition of both helium and argon in Tagish Lake fullerenes resemble the 'planetary' gases with $^3\text{He}/^{36}\text{Ar}$ ratios that approach ~ 0.01, as opposed to the solar value of ~ 1. Similar isotopic composition and temperature release patterns of the gasses were obtained upon combustion of the unextracted macromolecular carbon, suggesting that fullerenes may be the major carriers of planetary noble gasses in Tagish Lake (24).

These results, when compared with the analytical data available for other carbonaceous chondrites, show the Tagish Lake meteorite is as unique in its organic chemistry as it appears to be in its mineralogy and petrology (3). While most of its organic constituents are not exclusive, their selective distribution is, and presents a new example of chemical evolution. The main features of these organics are the dominance of water-soluble carboxyl and dicarboxyl compounds, the paucity of amino compounds, and the aromatic character of the insoluble carbon.

What can this composition tell us about the origin of its organic matter and the distinct origin of this meteorite? Soluble organics in meteorites have been generally viewed as products of parent body aqueous (and perhaps thermal) processing of reactive, volatile precursors such as water, HCN, NH_3 , and ^{13}C -, ^{15}N -, and deuterium rich interstellar organics (1). In the Tagish Lake suite we find no clear examples of such chemistry, as would be the abundant Murchison amino- and hydroxy-acids believed to have formed via a Strecker synthesis (25). Moreover some aliphatic compounds, e.g. carboxylic acids and n-alkanes, display a distinct linear chain preference, suggesting catalytic surface processes rather than the random combination of radicals predicted for interstellar molecules (1). However, Tagish Lake mineralogy shows evidence of water alteration

(3) and the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values of the meteorite aliphatic and aromatic dicarboxylic acids suggest that primitive interstellar materials were incorporated into organics of this meteorite as well (5). In view of the compositional and petrological heterogeneity of carbonaceous chondrites, the findings are not mutually exclusive but rather point to a similar, although somewhat broader scenario. In fact, the Tagish Lake organic content would be consistent with an origin from a primitive parent body which, prior to aqueous processing, was depleted or never acquired volatile compounds and accreted both nebular and interstellar larger molecules such as hydrocarbons, PAHs, nitriles, and dinitriles. These latter compounds are common in the interstellar clouds and would account, upon parent body accretion, water exposure and subsequent hydrolysis, for the carboxylic and dicarboxylic compounds found in Tagish Lake. Support for this chemistry comes from the: "prominence of nitriles and other cyano species" found in Tagish Lake extracts (26) and our identification of specific dinitriles as dicyanobenzene and dicyanotoluene.

Tagish Lake macromolecular carbon also has features suggestive of an interstellar origin, i.e. aromaticity, elevated δD , and the pyrolytic release of mostly polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) (27). It can reasonably be proposed that PAHs were predominant precursors to this material, since the compounds are abundant and ubiquitous in both circumstellar and interstellar gas phase environments (20) and, we may assume, were also abundant in the solar nebula. The alternative possibility exists that aliphatic hydrocarbons in the meteorite underwent condensation and aromatization as in terrestrial kerogens. However, such thermal alteration would not be consistent with the hydrogen abundance of the material, which implies an incomplete condensation of rings, the finding in the extracts of labile molecules, as nitriles, and the presence of a substantial aliphatic phase in more petrologically processed chondrites, as CVs (7).

Far from disappointing, the relative simplicity of Tagish Lake organic content provides unique insight to an outcome of early solar system chemical evolution not seen so far. In particular, the finding of just one suite of organic compounds matching those of Murchison and of some (but not all) the carbonaceous phases and compounds seen in other chondrites, demonstrates the presence of distinct organic synthetic processes in primitive meteorites. It also implies that the more complex organic matter of heterogeneous chondrites may result from multiple, separate evolutionary pathways.

References and Notes

1. J. R. Cronin, S. Chang, in *The Chemistry of Life's Origins*, J. M. Greenberg, C. X. Mendoza-Gomez, V. Pirronello, Eds (Kluwer Academic, Dordrecht, Netherlands, 1993) pp. 209-258, and references therein.
2. C. F. Chyba and C. Sagan, *Nature* **355**, 125-132 (1992).
3. P. G. Brown, A. R. Hildebrand, M. E. Zolensky, M. Grady, R. N. Clayton, *et al.*, *Science* **290**, 320-325 (2000).
4. S. Pizzarello, G. W. Cooper, *Meteoritic. Planet. Sci.* **36**, 897-909 (2001).
5. J. R. Cronin, S. Pizzarello, S. Epstein, R. V. Krishnamurthy, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **57**, 4745-4752 (1993).
6. J. R. Cronin, S. Pizzarello, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **54**, 2859-2868 (1990).
7. J. R. Cronin, S. Pizzarello, J. S. Frye, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **51**, 299-303 (1987).

8. Analyzed by gas chromatography-mass spectroscopy (GC-MS) as isopropyl esters. GC columns: ChyrasilDEX (Chrompack, 25m x .25mm) or Chirasil-Val (Alltech, 50m x .25mm). Typical program: 40°C initial, 5min., -100 @2°/min., -200 @4°/min.
9. GC-C-IRMS: HP 6890 GC, Finnigan high temperature conversion interphase III, and Mat Delta⁺-XL MS. GC conditions as for GC-MS (8). Oxidation was at 940°C with a ceramic oxidation reactor bearing NiO/CuO/Pt wires. Standard CO₂ (six pulses) δ¹³C: -10.07‰ (VPDB). Data analyzed with Finnigan ISODAT software, with σ ± 0.3 ‰ for peaks >0.5V.
10. -85‰ to -5‰, up to +5‰ for methanogenic bacteria.
11. Analyzed with DB-17 column (60m x .25mm, Agilent Technologies). Other δ¹³C values were: +7.7 ± 0.3‰ for a methyl-phthalimide and +5.9 ± 0.7‰, +10.5 ± 0.8‰, and +17.5 ± 0.4‰ for three dimethyl-phthalimides.
12. J. G. Lawless, G.U. Yuen, *Nature* **282**, 396-398 (1979).
13. G. W. Cooper, M. H. Thiemens, T. Jackson, S. Chang, *Science* **277**, 1072-1074 (1997) and references therein.
14. M. H. Studier, R. Hayatsu, E. Anders, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **36**, 189-215 (1972).
15. Airborne contamination can be absorbed readily by meteorites (28) and should be considered for Tagish Lake, which was recovered a week after its fall.
16. Operating conditions: Varian INOVA400 spectrometer at 9.4 T using the VACP MAS sequence, 50 KHz spectral width, 3.5 ms cross-polarization contact time, recycle delay 1.04 s, 6.7 μs ¹H90 pulse width, 28584 transients/spectrum, 55 kHz decoupling field, and 16.0 kHz spinning rate; 4 mm silicon nitride rotors with Torlon caps. Tagish Lake repeat analyses at 0.5, 1.0, and 2.0 ms contact time.
17. G. D. Cody, C. M. O'D Alexander, F. Tera, *Lunar Planet. Sci.* **30** #1582 (1999).
18. A. Gardinier, S. Derenne, F. Robert, F. Behar, C. Largeau, *et al.*, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* **184**, 9-21 (2000).
19. δD values determined by Thermal Conversion(TC)/Elemental Analyzer(EA) interfaced to Finnigan Delta⁺XL MS. Pyrolysis at 1450°C to yield hydrogen gas quantitatively. Standardization by hydrogen gas pulse, sample analyses repeated ten times.
20. L. J. Allamandola, S. A. Sanford, B. Wopenka, *Science* **237**, 56-59 (1987).
21. J. F. Kerridge, S. Chang, R. Shipp, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta* **51**, 2527-2540 (1987).
22. 1.3 ppm of fullerenes were isolated from the bulk carbonaceous residues by extraction with 1,2,3,5 tetramethylbenzene. The yield was incomplete, as for other meteorites (23), due to limited organic solubility of fullerenes.
23. L. Becker, R. J. Poreda, T. E. Bunch, *Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci.* **97**, 2979 (2000).
24. Helium within the extract was ~0.01% of total helium in the bulk material. ~40% of this total helium is released below 800°C, consistent with the extracted fullerene carrier. No other carbon carrier has been identified with similar low temperature release pattern.
25. E. T. Peltzer, J. L. Bada, *Nature* **272**, 443-444 (1978).
26. I. Gilmour, M. A. Sephton, V. K. Pearson, *Lunar Planet. Sci.* **32** #1969 (2001).
27. I. Gilmour, V. K. Pearson, M. A. Sephton, *Lunar Planet. Sci.* **32**, #1993 (2001)
28. J. Han, B. R. Simoneit, A. L. Burlingame, M. Calvin, *Nature* **222**, 364-365 (1969).
29. δ‰=(R_{sample} - R_{standard}/ R_{standard}) 103. For carbon R=¹³C/¹²C and the standard is VPDB. δ¹³C(VPDB) of isopropanol: -29.3‰ (EA-IRMS). δ¹³C mass balance equations: δ¹³C_{diacid} = [δ¹³C_{der. diacid} - a (-29.3)] / b (a, b: fractional carbon abundances of isopropanol and diacid, respectively). A procedural succinic acid standard gave no significant carbon fractionation.
30. J. R. Cronin, S. Pizzarello, D. P. Cruikshank, in: Meteorites and the Early Solar System, J. F. Kerridge, M. S. Matthews, Eds. (The University of Arizona Press, Tucson, 1988) pp. 819-8857.
31. G. W. Cooper, J. R. Cronin, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, **59**, 1003-1015 (1995).
32. We thank Michael Zolensky, Alan Hildebrand and James Brook for providing the Tagish Lake sample, John Cronin for much help and suggestions, Carleton Moore for supporting a student assistant, and four anonymous referees for helpful reviews. We gratefully acknowledge conversations with Max Bernstein, Christopher Chyba, Jason Dworkin, Iain Gilmour, Douglas Hudgins, Walter Huebner, and Alex Primak. The work was supported by NASA grants from the Exobiology (SP, YH, GC) and Cosmochemistry (LB) Divisions, and NSF grant CHE9808678 (NMR).

17 May 2001; accepted 14 August 2001

Published online 23 August 2001; 10.1126/science.1062614

Include this information when citing this paper.

Fig. 1. m/z 44 (bottom) and 45/44 (top) traces of a GC-C-IRMS analysis of Tagish Lake dicarboxylic acids (8-9). 1: succinic acid, 2: methyl succinic acid, 3: glutaric acid, 4: 2-methyl glutaric acid.

Fig. 2. Solid-state ¹³C Variable Amplitude Cross-Polarization-Magic Angle Spinning NMR spectra of insoluble macromolecular material from (A): Orgueil and (B): Tagish Lake meteorites. 1: protonated and non-protonated aromatic C, carboxyl C, and carbonyl C (100-250 ppm); 2: aliphatic and aromatic-linked CH₃, CH₂, and aliphatic C adjacent to heteroatom (0-100 ppm). Tagish Lake aliphatic ≤ 7.0%, from repeat analyses (16).

Fig. 3. LDMS mass spectrum of the higher fullerenes in the Tagish Lake and Murchison carbonaceous chondrites (22-24).

Table 1. Soluble organic compounds in the Tagish Lake and Murchison meteorites.

¹Concentrations based on chromatographic peak intensities, include compounds identified by reference standards and mass spectra. Variability was not estimated at this time, as measurements were obtained by analyses of one meteorite stone. ²Compounds identified with reference standards. ³This study. ⁴Not determined. ⁵Below detection (GC-MS).

Class	Tagish Lake	Murchison (30)	Concentration1 (ppm)	Compounds Identified²	Concentration (ppm)	Compounds Identified
Aliphatic hydrocarbons		5		12	> 35	140
Aromatic hydrocarbons		≥ 1		13	15-28	87
Dicarboxylic acids		17.5		18	> 30	17
Carboxylic acids		40.0		7	> 300	20
Pyridine carboxylic acids		7.5		7	> 7	7 ³
Dicarboximides		5.5		4	> 50	3 ³
Sulfonic acids		≥ 20		1	67	4 (13)
Amino acids		< 0.1		4	60	74
Amines		< 0.1		3	8	10
Amides		< 0.1		1	n.d. ⁴	4 (31)
Hydroxy acids		b.d. ⁵		0	15	7

Table 2. $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values (‰)* of individual meteoritic dicarboxylic acids

*by GC-C-IRMS, corrected for esterification (29)

Acid	Murchison	Tagish Lake
Succinic	+ 28.1 (\pm 1.1)	+ 22.5 (\pm 0.6)
methyl succinic	+ 26.5 (\pm 0.7)	+ 15.4 (\pm 3.0)
glutaric	+ 26.8 (\pm 0.3)	+ 22.9 (\pm 1.5)





